

STATE OF MICHIGAN
ATTORNEY DISCIPLINE BOARD
1999 ANNUAL REPORT

CONTENTS

Attorney Discipline Board Membersi
Attorney Discipline Board Staffii

Tables

Table 1 New Case Filed 1994 - 19995
Table 2 Discipline Orders Issued 1994 - 19996
Table 3 ADB Expenses, Fiscal Year 1998 - 19999

Appendices

Appendix A: Annual Activity Report10
Appendix B: List of Disciplined Attorneys,
by Type of Discipline11
Appendix C: 1999 Hearing Panelist Roster17
Appendix D: ADB Expenditures, October 1, 1998 - September 30, 199922

STATE OF MICHIGAN

ATTORNEY DISCIPLINE BOARD MEMBERS

KENNETH L. LEWIS, Esq. of Detroit, Chairperson
Term Expires: September 30, 2000

WALLACE D. RILEY, Esq. of Detroit, Vice-Chairperson
Term Expires: September 30, 2002

MICHAEL R. KRAMER, Esq. of Bloomfield Hills, Secretary
Term Expires: September 30, 2001

C.H. DUDLEY, M.D., of Bloomfield Hills
Term Expires: September 30, 2000

NANCY A. WONCH, Esq. of Lansing
Term Expires: September 30, 2002

GRANT J. GRUEL, Esq. of Grand Rapids
Term Expires: September 30, 2000

DIETHER H. HAENICKE, of Kalamazoo
Term Expires: September 30, 2002

THEODORE J. ST. ANTOINE, Esq. of Ann Arbor
Term Expires: September 30, 2002

RONALD L. STEFFENS, of Shelby Township
Term Expires: September 30, 2002

ATTORNEY DISCIPLINE BOARD STAFF

JOHN F. VAN BOLT
Executive Director

MARK A. ARMITAGE
Associate Director

JENNIFER M. PETTY
Legal Assistant

SHERRY MIFSUD
Office Administrator

LYNN L. SAATCHI
Legal Secretary

KATHY LEAL-PAREDES
Assignment Clerk

JENNIFER M. COURTS
Assignment Clerk

STATE OF MICHIGAN

ATTORNEY DISCIPLINE BOARD

ANNUAL REPORT

January 1, 1999 - December 31, 1999

Organization and Composition

The Attorney Discipline Board is the adjudicative arm of the Michigan Supreme Court for the discharge of the Court's exclusive constitutional responsibility to supervise and discipline Michigan attorneys. The Board, along with its prosecutorial counterpart, the Attorney Grievance Commission, is part of the bifurcated system of discipline described in Chapter 9.100 of the Michigan Court Rules.

The Attorney Discipline Board consists of six lawyers and three public members (non-lawyers) appointed by the Supreme Court. A member may not serve more than two three-year terms. All members serve without

compensation. The Board's chairperson and vice-chairperson are appointed to one year terms by the Supreme Court. The Board's secretary is elected by its members.

From October 1998 to September 30, 1999 the Board's composition was: Albert L. Holtz, Chairperson; Kenneth L. Lewis, Vice-Chairperson; Barbara B. Gattorn, Secretary; and members Elizabeth N. Baker, C.H. Dudley, M.D., Grant J. Gruel, Michael R. Kramer, Roger E. Winkelman and Nancy A. Wonch.

In September 1999, the Supreme Court appointed four new members to the Board to serve three year terms commencing October 1, 1999. Appointed were lawyer members Wallace D. Riley of Detroit and Theodore J. St. Antoine of Ann Arbor and lay members Dr. Diether H. Haenicke of Kalamazoo and Ronald L. Steffens of Shelby Township.

The courts, the public and the legal profession in Michigan are deeply indebted to Elizabeth N. Baker, Barbara B. Gattorn, Albert L. Holtz and Roger E. Winkelman for their dedicated service as members of the Board. Each of these individuals brought to the Board his or her unique blend of wisdom, patience, curiosity, humor, honor and common sense. Each completed their terms with the lasting respect and affection of the Board's members and staff.

Staff

Michigan Court Rule 9.110 authorizes the Attorney Discipline Board to appoint an attorney as its counsel. The Board's full-time staff consists of John F. Van Bolt, Executive Director and General Counsel; Mark A. Armitage, Associate Director; Jennifer M. Petty, Legal Assistant; Sherry Mifsud, Office Administrator; Lynn L. Saatchi, Legal Secretary; Kathy Leal-Paredes, Assignment Clerk and Jennifer M. Courts, Assignment Clerk. The Board's office and hearing room are at One Kennedy Square, 719 Griswold Street, Suite 1910, Detroit, MI 48226.

Hearing Panels

The Board maintains a current roster of over 450 attorneys appointed annually to serve on three member hearing panels. The 1999 hearing panelist roster is attached as Appendix "C". The Board has continued its efforts to appoint attorneys as panel members who represent a broad range of professional experience. With the cooperation of the Women Lawyers Association and the Wolverine Bar Association, and other special interest bar associations, the Board actively encourages the participation of women and minorities in Michigan's discipline system.

Upon the filing of a formal complaint, judgment of conviction or petition for reinstatement, the matter is assigned to a hearing panel. Proceedings before a panel are open to the public and are conducted under the Michigan Court Rules applicable to a civil trial in a circuit court and the Michigan Rules of Evidence. During 1999, the Board's hearing panels conducted 164 public hearings.

Complaints submitted by clients, judges or other lawyers regarding an attorney's conduct are investigated by the Grievance Administrator and his or her staff under the supervision of the Attorney Grievance Commission, a separate agency. If formal disciplinary proceedings are authorized by the Commission, the charges of misconduct are set forth in a formal complaint filed by the Administrator. The charges in the complaint must be established by a preponderance of the evidence. If the charges of misconduct are not established, the panel must enter an order of dismissal. Upon a finding of misconduct, the panel must conduct a separate phase of the hearing to determine the appropriate discipline. The levels of discipline provided in the court rules are reprimand, probation, license suspension and license revocation (disbarment). In a discipline matter decided July 15, 1997, the Supreme Court held that under rare circumstances a finding of professional misconduct may result in an order of discipline which effectively imposes no discipline on the attorney. Grievance Administrator

v Deutch, 455 Mich 149, 163 (1997). Final orders of discipline finding misconduct but imposing no discipline were entered in three cases in 1999.

Discipline orders must include an assessment of costs incurred by the Grievance Commission and Discipline Board, and may include an order of restitution to an aggrieved client. Orders of reprimand or suspension may include additional conditions relevant to the established misconduct, including legal education, reformation of law office practices and personal counseling.

Unless appealed within 21 days, an order of discipline entered by a hearing panel constitutes a final order and may be enforced in civil contempt proceedings by the Grievance Administrator.

Appeals

The respondent, the Grievance Administrator or the complainant may petition the Attorney Discipline Board for a review of an order entered by a hearing panel. The Board's review in such cases is based upon the record presented to the hearing panel and the written and oral arguments presented by the parties on appeal. Following its review, the Board may enter an order affirming, reversing or modifying the panel's order. In addition, the Board regularly considers and disposes of various motions seeking stays of discipline, extensions of time to pay costs, consolidation or severance of pending matters and the institution of show cause proceedings for alleged violations of discipline orders.

During 1999, the Board held eight regularly scheduled meetings and heard oral arguments in 23 review cases. Of the 21 appeals involving orders imposing discipline, the Board affirmed the hearing panel decision in 15 cases (71%); increased discipline in four cases (19%); and remanded two cases to the hearing panel for further proceedings (10%). The Board affirmed a hearing panel order of dismissal in one case.

Summary of Disclosure Requests

There were no motions for disclosure filed with the Board pursuant to MCR 9.126(D)(7) or MCR 9.126(E)(5) during 1999.

New Cases Filed

There were 165 new formal complaints filed in 1999. Of these, 132 complaints ⁽¹⁾ contained original charges of misconduct based upon an investigation conducted by the Attorney Grievance Commission. The remaining 33 formal complaints ⁽²⁾ were based solely upon the failure of the respondent/attorney to answer the initial formal complaint, a separate violation under MCR 9.104(7). Such complaints are consolidated for hearing before the panel to which the original complaint has been assigned. The 132 GA formal complaints filed in 1999 represent a 6% decrease from the 140 such complaints filed in 1998.

Six new files were opened upon the filing of petitions for reinstatement in accordance with MCR 9.123(B). An additional 12 cases were commenced under MCR 9.120 with the filing of a judgment of conviction establishing that an attorney had been convicted of a crime. Two new matters were commenced with the filing of a petition seeking reciprocal discipline in accordance with MCR 9.104 as the result of a discipline order issued in another jurisdiction.

The 198 new files opened by the Board in 1999 represent an 18% decrease when compared with the 242 new cases in 1998. The following table (Table 1) illustrates the Board's annual intake of new cases during the past six years.

Table 1. New Cases Filed, 1994 - 1999.



Orders of Discipline/Dismissal

There were 147 final disposition orders issued in 1999, including orders of discipline, dismissal, transferring an attorney to inactive status and granting or denying reinstatement. Because some of these orders involved two or more consolidated complaints, the 147 final disposition orders accounted for the closure of 176 docketed complaints, including supplemental complaints for failure to answer. Orders of discipline (reprimand, suspension, and revocation and orders finding misconduct but imposing no discipline) were issued in 121 cases. A complete list of the orders of discipline issued in 1999 appears in Appendix "B." Orders of discipline issued since 1994 are illustrated in Table 2, below.

Table 2. Discipline Orders Issued, 1994 - 1999.



Number of Lawyers Disciplined

A lawyer may receive more than one discipline order in a given year. In 1999, 137 lawyers accumulated 147 orders of discipline. Compared to the previous year, the number of lawyers subject to discipline increased from 131 to 137.

In 1994, the Supreme Court ruled the Board retains jurisdiction to consider misconduct during the period of licensure by attorneys whose licenses were later revoked.⁽³⁾ Of the 16 lawyers whose licenses were revoked in 1999, three were the subject of two or more revocation orders during the calendar year.

Discipline By Consent

The respondent and the Grievance Administrator may enter into a stipulation for a consent order of discipline after a formal complaint has been filed. This procedure, described in MCR 9.115(F)(5), allows the respondent to admit the charges in the complaint, or plead no contest, in exchange for a stated form of discipline. The stipulation must be approved by both the Attorney Grievance Commission and a hearing panel. Forty two consent orders were approved in 1999, accounting for 30% of the discipline orders issued.

Three attorneys consented to disbarment and 18 attorneys consented to suspensions ranging from 30 days to five years. The 21 consent orders of reprimand approved during the year accounted for 64% of all reprimands issued in 1999.

Misconduct Resulting In Discipline

As in prior years, neglect of client matters was the single largest category of professional misconduct resulting in discipline, accounting for 38% of the discipline orders issued. Such neglect ranged from failure to provide competent or diligent representation on behalf of a single client to, in some cases, complete abandonment of an attorney's practice.

For statistical purposes, cases involving neglect of client matters coupled with an attorney's false

statement to the client or to the Grievance Administrator are recorded in a separate category. Those cases accounted for an additional 4% of all discipline orders issued in 1999.

The next largest category of misconduct, accounting for 13% of all discipline orders, resulted from an attorney's criminal conviction. The 19 criminal convictions included five convictions for the possession or distribution of controlled substances, four convictions involving fraud or embezzlement, three automobile related offenses (including impaired driving), and two convictions based upon an attorney's violation of the Internal Revenue Code as well as five other convictions in various other categories.

Other types of misconduct resulting in discipline in 1999 included improper handling of client funds (5%), misrepresentation to a tribunal (4%), conflicts of interest (3%), and violation of a prior discipline order (2%).

Reinstatements

Attorneys suspended for 179 days or less are automatically reinstated upon the filing of an affidavit of compliance with the Supreme Court. In cases of revocation or suspensions of 180 days or more, the attorney must file a petition for reinstatement which is followed by an investigation and a hearing before a panel to determine his or her fitness to re-enter the practice of law. Attorneys suspended for three years or more must undergo examination and recertification by the Michigan Board of Law Examiners. In Michigan, a disbarred attorney may petition for reinstatement after five years. Six reinstatement petitions were filed with the Board and assigned to panels for hearing in 1999. The Board or its panels issued nine orders reinstating attorneys whose licenses had been suspended for terms greater than six months.

Pending Case Load

As of December 31, 1999, there were a total of 158 open discipline or reinstatement cases pending before a hearing panel, the Attorney Discipline Board or the Michigan Supreme Court, as follows:

	<u>Pending 12-31-99</u>	<u>Pending 12-31-98</u>
Supreme Court:	11	18
Attorney Discipline Board:	27	25
Hearing Panels:	<u>120</u>	<u>110</u>
Total:	158	153

Funding and Expenses

The Attorney Discipline Board receives no public funds. Michigan's attorney discipline system (Attorney Discipline Board and Attorney Grievance Commission) is funded entirely by the State Bar of Michigan which derives its income primarily from the dues assessed against its members. Under the current dues structure approved by the Supreme Court, Michigan lawyers under the age of 70 pay mandatory annual dues of \$260, of which \$100 (38%) is specifically allocated for deposit in the Attorney Discipline System Fund. For the fiscal year which ended September 30, 1999, the Attorney Discipline System had total revenue of \$3,279,406 and total expenses of \$3,075,744.

During the fiscal year 1998 - 1999, the Board's total expenses were \$698,850 (29% of the combined expenses of the Discipline Board and Grievance Commission). The Board's receipts from reimbursed transcript costs and copying charges amounted to \$53,957, leaving net expenses of \$644,893. This figure represented an increase of 3.0% compared to the previous fiscal year. A chart summarizing the Board's expenses for 1998 - 1999 is included below (Table 3). A complete itemization of the Board's approved budget and actual expenses is attached to this report as Appendix D.

Table 3. ADB Expenses 1998-1999 Fiscal Year



Further Information

The Attorney Discipline Board has significantly expanded its website: www.adbmich.org. The site includes recent notices of discipline, access to the discipline history of all attorneys disciplined in Michigan since October 1, 1978, a searchable data base including the full text of all opinions of the Attorney Discipline Board and all notices of discipline and reinstatement since October 1, 1978 and links to related sites in the fields of attorney discipline and ethics.

For further information regarding the operation of the Michigan Attorney Discipline Board, please contact:

Attorney Discipline Board
719 Griswold Street
Suite 1910
Detroit, MI 48226-3342
Telephone: (313) 963-5553
Facsimile: (313) 963-5571

Kenneth L. Lewis, Chairperson
John F. Van Bolt, Executive Director

APPENDIX "A"

ANNUAL ACTIVITY REPORT

JANUARY 1, 1999 THROUGH DECEMBER 31, 1999

- **CASES FILED**

- Formal Complaints (total).....165
 - New Formal Complaints (GA).....132
 - Failure-to-Answer Complaints (FA).....33
 - Automatic Interim Suspensions (AI).....6
 - Judgment of Conviction (JC).....12
 - Petitions for Reciprocal Discipline (RD).....2
 - Petitions for Transfer to Inactive Status (PI).....2
 - Petitions for Reinstatement (RP).....6
 - Miscellaneous (MZ).....2

- **TOTAL CASES FILED 198**

- **FINAL DISPOSITIONS**

- Final Orders of Discipline.....121
 - Revocations.....21
 - Suspensions.....64

- Subject to MCR 9.123(A).....34
- Subject to MCR 9.123(B)26
- Subject to MCR 9.123(B) & (C) . . . 4

- Reprimands 33
- Misconduct But No Discipline 3
- Probations 0
- Transfers to Inactive Status.....2
- Dismissals.....14
- Reinstatements Granted.....9
- Reinstatements Denied/Dismissed.....0
- Other.....1

- **TOTAL FINAL DISPOSITION ORDERS.....147**
- Total Cases Closed (Including All Consolidated Cases).....176

- **OTHER NOTICES ISSUED**

- Automatic Interim Suspensions Under MCR 9.120.....6
- Automatic Reinstatements Under MCR 9.123(A).....19

- TOTAL OTHER NOTICE ISSUED.....25

- **HEARINGS**

- Scheduled.....352
- Held.....164

- **COSTS**

Total Costs Reimbursed to the State Bar of Michigan by Respondents and Petitioners.....\$57,310.33

APPENDIX "B"

DISCIPLINED ATTORNEYS BY TYPE OF DISCIPLINE - 1999

REVOCATIONS

RESPONDENT	EFFECTIVE DATE
ABOOD, Jeffrey J.	August 27, 1997
ABOOD, Jeffrey J.	August 27, 1997
BANK, Kevin A.	June 24, 1999
CANNON, James, Jr.	February 5, 1999
CANNON, James, Jr.	September 23, 1999
CHRISTOPHER, L. Katharine	September 20, 1999
GOLDNER, Sheldon	June 23, 1997

KLINTWORTH, William F.	March 2, 1999
KOOPMAN, Thomas R.	August 28, 2003
LUCAS, James C.	March 3, 1999
PEROVICH, Paul C.	March 29, 1999
SCHMIDT, Robert M.	January 29, 1999
SHERWIN, Harry S.	November 4, 1999
SHERWIN, Harry S.	February 10, 1999
SHERWIN, Harry S.	November 20, 1999
SHULMAN, Gregory D.	December 4, 1998
SMITH, Arthur Allan	January 19, 1999
SMITH, Martin J.	March 11, 1999
STOVER, John E.	March 30, 1998
WALKER, Marguerite F., II	July 31, 1999
WINIEMKO, Ronald C.	November 24, 1998

SUSPENSIONS SUBJECT TO MCR 9.123(B) and (C) [Three years or more]

RESPONDENT	LENGTH	EFFECTIVE DATE
SCHOBER, Henry W.	Four Years	August 31, 1994
SOLOMON, Barry E.	Five Years	June 5, 1998
VANASSCHE, Paul A.	Five Years	November 22, 1999
WOELKERS, David A.	Three Years	February 18, 1999

SUSPENSIONS SUBJECT TO MCR 9.123(B) [180 days but less than three years]

RESPONDENT	LENGTH	EFFECTIVE DATE
AGREE, Clayton C.	One Year	March 3, 1999
BAUGH, Ronald M.	One Year	July 7, 1999
BIRETTA, Eric E.	Two Years	June 26, 1998
BRAHMS, Enid R.	180 Days	April 15, 1999
BRAHMS, Enid R.	One Year	April 15, 1999
BUSH, Neal	180 Days	January 3, 2000
CURTIN, Raymond F.	270 Days	April 20, 1999
DEAN, David M.	18 Months	February 16, 1999
EDMONDS, James L.	180 Days	September 24, 1999
FREY, William D.	18 Months	December 9, 1999
FUNK, Douglas A.	180 Days	March 30, 1999
HILL, J. Michael	180 Days	March 31, 1999
HOLT, Jonathan E.	18 Months	January 8, 1999
MONTGOMERY, Bradley S.	180 Days	January 20, 1999
MORRISON, Curtis W.	180 Days	May 6, 1999

PORTER, June A.	Six Months	April 17, 2001
RICCA, Thomas A.	180 Days	February 6, 1999
SHANER, Theodore A., Jr.	180 Days	April 9, 1999
STEVENS, Glenn R.	One Year	March 11, 1999
STRAIN, Dale M., Jr.	180 Days	October 21, 1999
THOMPSON, Gregory S.	Two Years	January 15, 1999
VANASSCHE, Paul A.	180 Days	August 6, 1999
WARTELLA, Rudolph A., III	180 Days	January 20, 1999
WATKINS, Lisa C.	180 Days	February 16, 1999
WILKINS, Gregory L.	180 Days	June 4, 1999
WILKINS, Gregory L.	180 Days	June 8, 2001

SUSPENSIONS SUBJECT TO MCR 9.123(A) [Less than 180 days]

RESPONDENT	LENGTH	EFFECTIVE DATE
ADAMS, Stephen M.	30 Days	December 21, 1996
ALBRITTON, Brian D.	30 Days	October 6, 1999
ANDERSON, Robert E.	60 Days	March 16, 1999
BEERS, Lafayette M.	90 Days	May 1, 1999
BLACKMOND, Frederick J.	30 Days	October 15, 1999
BRUSSTAR, John W.	179 Days	October 13, 1998
CHRISTOPHER, L. Katharine	60 Days	December 10, 2001
CURTIS, Paul Daniel	40 Days	December 22, 1998
DETTLOFF, Gary R.	179 Days	March 19, 1997
DUNN, Dennis James	60 Days	January 21, 1999
HAMILTON, Mark S.	90 Days	May 20, 1999
HUNLEY, Gary D.	60 Days	May 15, 1999
KELLY, Mary K.	179 Days	September 3, 1997
KIERPIEC, Joseph P.	30 Days	November 20, 1999
KIRKLAND, Arthur C., Jr.	30 Days	June 30, 1999
MANZIE, Georgia D.	120 Days	October 14, 1998
MILLER, D. Richard	90 Days	July 9, 1999
NAVARRE, Philip B.	179 Days	July 7, 1999
NEW, Judith Topham	30 Days	April 7, 1999
PORTER, June A.	90 Days	July 21, 1999
ROMINGER, Charles S.	30 Days	December 3, 1999
SCHWARTZ, Michael E.	90 Days	October 21, 1999
SCOTT, Martin A.	60 Days	June 7, 1999
SHAW, James R.	120 Days	June 15, 1999
SLOAN, Craig W.	30 Days	March 10, 1999

SLOAN, Craig W.	90 Days	January 19, 1999
SNYDER, Dennis H.	60 Days	February 17, 1999
STONE, Horace E.	30 Days	January 21, 1999
TRENT, Muriel Deborah	30 Days	May 10, 1999
WETHERINGTON, C. Barry	30 Days	June 30, 1999
WILLIAMS, Terry M.	30 Days	September 16, 1999
YIANNATJI, John L.	179 Days	January 21, 1999
YUILLE, Bruce H.	60 Days	June 4, 1999
ZIEGLER, Thomas K.	179 Days [Less 77 Days]	December 21, 1999

REPRIMANDS

RESPONDENT	EFFECTIVE DATE
BAKER, Jonathan S.	March 2, 1999
BARNETT, William S.	February 13, 1999
BARRETTA, Samuel Nicholas	October 14, 1998
BARTHWELL, Sidney, Jr.	March 3, 1999
BISHOP, Frederick C.	March 2, 1999
BLACK, David D.	July 16, 1999
BURKHART, Thomas D.	November 30, 1999
CURTIS, Paul D.	October 21, 1999
DEVINE, John J., Jr.	April 1, 1999
DUBAY-FAWLEY, Catherine (FAWLEY, Catherine L.)	February 5, 1999
EASTERLY, Robert W.	December 28, 1999
GRIFFIN, John C.	December 15, 1999
HAMEL, Douglas	May 1, 1998
HARLEY, Robert L., Jr.	January 20, 1999
HOWARD, Austin A.	February 25, 1999
HOWELL, Vicky O.	July 8, 1999
KASBEN, Beryl W. Hoffman	October 6, 1999
LEWIS, Allen J.	July 20, 1999
LOCKHART, Steve B.	December 11, 1999
McFADDEN, William R.	April 21, 1999
MURPHY, Keith T.	June 23, 1999
O'CONNELL, James D.	February 25, 1999
POPRAWA, Joseph W.	July 24, 1999
SIEGRIST, Howard S.	December 29, 1999
SMITH, Michael W.	December 23, 1999
STEINBERG, Michael W.	June 29, 1999
STROIA, Eugene J.	January 12, 1999

TEKLINSKI, Mark H.	May 4, 1999
TERRELL, Thomas	December 15, 1999
THORMAN, Susan L.	January 27, 1999
WOODS, Stephen K.	August 14, 1999
WOODSIDE, Sharon Clark	October 21, 1999
ZEEMERING, Ina M.	November 26, 1999

ORDER OF NO DISCIPLINE

RESPONDENT	EFFECTIVE DATE
CAREY, Robert J.	April 1, 1999
DEUTCH, Martin G.	July 9, 1999
KOPCZYNSKI, Debra A.	August 6, 1999

TRANSFERS TO INACTIVE STATUS

RESPONDENT	EFFECTIVE DATE
EMBREE, Kenneth	April 12, 1999
WOOD, George G.	May 8, 1999

REVOCATIONS.....21
SUSPENSIONS - MCR 9.123(B) and (C).....4
SUSPENSIONS - MCR 9.123(B).....26
SUSPENSIONS - MCR 9.123(A).....34
REPRIMANDS.....33
NO/DISCIPLINE.....3
TRANSFERS TO INACTIVE STATUS.....2

APPENDIX "C"

1999 HEARING PANEL ROSTER (4)

(For the period 1/1/99 to 12/31/99)

ADA

Kent County

SMIETANKA, John Allen

ALLEGAN

Allegan County

TOOMAN, Lester J.

ANN ARBOR

Washtenaw County

CARTER, Stefani A.
CONNORS, Margaret A.
FINK, Sally Claire
GREEN, Philip
KIEFER, John B.
KOVACH, Susan A.
LAIRD, John R.
LAPORTE, Adele P.
LAX, Jerold
LOVERNICK, Richard N.
NICHOLS, Margaret J.
SACKS, Monika H.
SCARNECCHIA, Suellyn
SCHWARTZ, Elizabeth R.

AUBURN HILLS

Oakland County

BUSACCA, David W.
DEAGOSTINO, Thomas M.
LYON, Mark W.

BATTLE CREEK

Calhoun County

BLASKE, E. Robert
CHRIST, Chris T.
GEIL, Thomas D.
KARRE, Nelson T.
LEVY, Paul R.
STEFFEL, Jr., Vern J.
SULLIVAN, James M.

BAY CITY

Bay County

LEARMAN, Sr., Richard C.
PIGGOTT, John W.

BEAVERTON

Gladwin County

PEMBERTON, Paul J.

BIG RAPIDS

Mecosta County

WALZ, Kenneth P.

BINGHAM FARMS

Oakland County

ALSPECTOR, Jacob I.
CANVASSER, Sue Ann
HARNISCH, Alan C.
LOGAN, Leslie Anne
METZ, Virginia F.
RYAN, Stephen M.
ZIVIAN, Etta B.
ZUPPKE, David F.

BIRMINGHAM

Oakland County

BASKIN, Henry
BINKLEY, David A.
BUESSER, III, Frederick G.
FISCHER, Paul J.
FRIEDMAN, Michelle T.
GOLD, Edward D.
HOUGHTON, Jr., Ralph H.
KATZ, Norman D.
LAWSON, David M.
McCANN, D. Michael
MORGANROTH, Fred
OCHS, Norman P.
SCHNELZ, Kurt E.
SHERR, Paul D.
SIMPSON, Christine A.
VICTOR, Steven I.
WILLIAMS, James J.

BLOOMFIELD HILLS

Oakland County

BALIAN, Michael J.
BAUM, Martin S.
BROOKOVER, Hon. Thomas W.
BURDICK, James W.
CHARTRAND, Douglas A.
CRANMER, Thomas W.
DAMREN, Samuel C.
DARIN, Jr., Dennis A.
DEVINE, Sr., Daniel C.
EGGENBERGER, Robert E.
FABRIZIO, Joseph J.
FEMRITE, Marcia E.

FRYHOFF, Timothy T.
GARIEPY, Robert L.
GOETZ, Jr., Angus G.
GOLDMAN, Barry
GOOGASIAN, George A.
#HOWLETT, James L.
JANOVER, Robert H.
KANTER, Alan M.
LEONARD, Norbert B.
LUJAN, Joseph G.
MANIKOFF, V. John
McCONNELL, Kenneth B.
PAPPAS, Edward H.
PARKER, Joyce E.
RANDALL, Anne Loridas
ROGERS, John T.
ROY, William A.
SHECTER, Lynn H.
SIMPSON, Thomas C.
STEWART, Jeffrey T.
SUGERMAN, Donald F.
TEICHER, Mark L.
TOOHEY, Robert E.
VOCHT, Michelle E.
WELLER, II, Robert Y.

BOYNE CITY

Charlevoix County

ARNER, Timothy D.

CADILLAC

Wexford County

McCURDY, David S.

CENTER LINE

Macomb County

SCHOENHERR-WARNEZ, Florence M.

CHELSEA

Washtenaw County

FLINTOFT, Peter C.

CLARE

Clare County

TRUCKS, Jay F.

CLARKSTON

Oakland County

**BULLARD, III, Rockwood W.
CARUSO, Kathryn M.**

CLINTON TWP

Macomb County

**DIXON, Ronald R.
HRIBAR, Robert J.
JANSEN, Wendy A.
PUZZUOLI, Joseph P.
RINI, James W.**

DEARBORN

Wayne County

**BERNHARD, Christine A.
LAKE, Timothy W.
MILHOUSE, Donna R.
VENDITTELLI, Nicholas J.
WYGONIK, Richard**

DEARBORN HEIGHTS

Wayne County

**CONSTANTAKIS, Clarence R.
HURWITZ, Miles A.
LEMIRE, John J.
RIVARD, Jr., Donald M.
WALLACH, Howard I.**

DETROIT

Wayne County

**ANDERSON-DAVIS, Janet
ARNDT, Trisha J.
BAUMHART, III, A. David
BENSON, Gail S.
BOLDEN, Jr., Carl B.
BOLTON, Robert S.
BOLTZ, Russ E.
BUFFINGTON, Lamont E.
BURGESS, Laurence C.
CALILLE, Albert**

CHABOT, Rae Lee
CHURIKIAN, Samuel J.
COSTELLO, Margaret A.
COTHORN, John A.
DAKMAK, George P.
DINGES, Robert J.
EDWARDS, Sharon-Lee
EISENBERG, Stuart B.
ESSHAKI, Gene J.
FIELDMAN, Elaine S.
GAGE, William C.
GARZIA, Samuel A.
GERSHEL, Alan M.
GOLDSMITH, Mark A.
GRUSKIN, Michael A.
GURWIN, Howard E.
GUSHEÉ, Richard B.
HAMPTON, II, Verne C.
HARRIS, Richard R.
HELLAND, Lynn A.
JOHNSON, Duane R.
JOHNSON, Jr., John E.
KASIBORSKI, Jr., Chester E.
KITCH, Richard A.
KUPLICKI, Francis P.
LICHTERMAN, Susan S.
LIZZA, John B.
LORENCE, Gerald M.
MacMILLAN, Mary Rose
MANION, Paul J.
MAVEAL, Gary M.
MILLER, Bruce A.
MILLER, Camille Stearns
MYERS, Rodman N.
NIFOROS, Lambro
NOWIKOWSKI, Eileen
PEREGORD, Jennifer J.
PHILLIPS, Dwight W.
PITTS, Stanley H.
PLUMB, Frederick B.
REED, Gregory J.
RODWAN, Gail O.
RONAYNE, III, John J.
ROSS, Steven P.
SAFRANEK, Stephen J.
SAUGET, William J.
SAXTON, William M.
SCHONBERG, Edward R.
SCOTT, John E. S.

SELLERS, Jacqueline H.
SERYAK, Richard J.
SHERROD, Patricia L.
SIMON, Basil T.
SIMPSON, Samuel L.
SINCLAIR, Timothy R.
SMITH, James A.
SUNDQUIST, Richard A.
SUSSER, Danielle F.
TALON, Lawrence S.
TALON, Marianne G.
TEALL, Graham L.
THOMAS, Cynthia G.
THOMAS, James C.
TOUNSEL, Nathan M.
TRZCINSKI, Thomas J.
TUKEL, Jonathan
URSO, John R.
VAN HOEK, Dawn A.
VARNER, C. Jane
VARTANIAN, Michael G.
WALKER, David R.
WARD, James R.
WATZA, Michael J.
WEBER, Richard D.
WEINER, Stuart S.
WELLS, Steven W.
WERDER, Mark R.
WILLIAMS, Avery K.
WILSON, III, Edward Reilly
WIRTH, George N.
WYNNE, James E.
YOTT, Cynthia K.
YOUMANS, Edward G.
ZEMMOL, Allen

DEXTER

Washtenaw County

KITCHEN, Leonard K.

EAST LANSING

Ingham County

BOSSENBROOK, Arlyn J.
CASEY, Nan Elizabeth
EDGAR, Mary C.
FORESMAN, Jr., Raymond J.
McCARTHY, Robert E.

ESCANABA

Delta County

CLARK, Richard C.

ELK RAPIDS

Antrim County

FISHER, Joseph C.

FARMINGTON HILLS

Oakland County

ABRAMS, Nina Dodge
BATTERSBY, Michael L.
BERNSTEIN, Douglas C.
BERNSTEIN, Samuel I.
BERNSTEIN, Stephen R.
BUYERS, Russell A.
COLTON, Michael W.
FOX, Sharon Mullin
FREILICH, Diane M.
#GABEL, Clarence M.
JORDAN, Brian J.
MANSOUR, Peter G.
MATZ, Steven J.
MUGERIAN, Marjorie Nanian
RAVITZ, Allyn Carol
ROBY, Steven B.
SEIFMAN, Barry A.
STULBERG, Elaine Grand
SUROWIEC, Gerald S.
YOCKEY, Kurt D.
YOCKEY, Michael J.
ZAUSMER, Mark J.

FLINT

Genesee County

BAESSLER, Joseph E.
BARKEY, Brian M.
GOLDSTEIN, Richard M.
GRIFFIN, Walter P.
HENNEKE, Edward G.
#HICKS, L. James
KRELLWITZ, Michael W.
MANGAPORA, Michael J.
PIPER, Randolph P.

**SHULMAN, Leonard B.
SPENDER, Steven F.
STREBY, John A.
TREMBLEY, James J.
WHITESMAN, Barney R**

FORT GRATIOT

St. Clair County

McNAMEE, John B.

FOWLERVILLE

Livingston County

COX, Joseph C.

FRANKFORT

Benzie County

MCKAY, Joan S.

FRANKLIN

Oakland County

FENTON, Jerome L.

GAYLORD

Otsego County

**BLUMBERG, Elliot J.
COTANT, James C.**

GLADWIN

Gladwin County

KRECKMAN, Thomas I.

GRAND BLANC

Genesee County

**CARL, Jean P.
WILLIAMS, Kendall B.**

GRAND RAPIDS

Kent County

**BACON, Terrance R.
BLACK, James G.
BOOZER, Gordon B.**

BRASIC, Jon J.
DILLEY, A. Newton
DUGAN, Robert J.
EDGAR, Christopher L.
FARR, William S.
KAMM, David G.
MUDIE, Kent W.
REAMON, Martha E.
REAMON, Sr., William G.
REAMON, Jr., William G.
SMIETANKA, John A.
THEIME, R. Kevin
VAN'T HOF, William K.

GROSSE POINTE

Wayne County

BAGNO, Anne Warren
SOURIS, Jane K.

GROSSE POINTE PARK

Wayne County

CHADWELL, Kenneth R.
GRAVES, Lola Glass
McINTYRE, Anita G.

HARBOR SPRINGS

Emmet County

RAMER, James T.

HARPER WOODS

Wayne County

PESSINA, Cyril C.

HAZEL PARK

Oakland County

WILSON, Eric S.

HIGHLAND

Oakland County

HICKOX, J. Michael

HOLLAND

Ottawa County

**MARQUIS, John R.
MULDER, Andrew J.**

HOUGHTON

Houghton County

DAAVETTILA, Robert T.

HOWELL

Livingston County

**CHRISTIAN, Stewart A.
DRICK, Jay R.
HEIKKINEN, Arthur**

HUNTINGTON WOODS

Oakland County

ROSIN, David I.

IONIA

Ionia County

O'CONNOR, Rex P.

IRONWOOD

Gogebic County

McDONALD, Sr., David E.

ISHPEMING

Marquette County

HANSEN, Walter L.

JACKSON

Jackson County

BARTON, Bruce A.

KALAMAZOO

Kalamazoo County

**BAUCKHAM, John H.
CONTOS, Jr., Harry
DELEHANTY, Mary E.**

FENTON, Stuart L.
GETTING, Jeffrey S.
HAYTER, Karen M.
LENNON, George H.
LENNON, Robert R.
LEVINE, Sharan Lee
LILLY, Terrence J.
RUSSELL, Gregory W.
RYAN, William J.

LANSING

Ingham County

BYERLEY, Thomas K.
CHARNEY, Elaine H.
DEVINE, Barry F.
DOSTER, Eric E.
DUNLAP, Peter L.
EMERY, Lawrence J.
FINK, Joseph A.
FRIEDMAN, Leo H.
HEOS, James T.
HOGAN, Patrick R.
HOOVER, C. Mark
HORNBACH, Oskar M.
JAMO, James S.
LATTERMAN, Mark A.
LOOSE, John J.
MALLORY, Susan L.
PRICE, Kathaleen Rae
SCHLOSSBERG, Allen
STROPKAI, James L.
WADDELL, David D.

LIVONIA

Wayne County

BARTOS, Suzanne P.
CUMMINGS, Owen J.
TUCK, Marsha Lynn

LUDINGTON

Mason County

ANDREWS, Jr., Robert D.
NICHOLSON, Gary L.

MANISTEE

Manistee County

KELEHER, Dennis L.

MARQUETTE

Marquette County

**GIRARD, Dennis H.
KANGAS, Roger W.
KEEFE, Ronald D.
PENCE, Steven L.
STEVENS, Mark P.**

MEMPHIS

Macomb County

DELEKTA, Diane Hubel

MENOMINEE

Menominee County

BURGESS, Janis M.

METAMORA

Lapeer County

PETERS, Neill T.

MIDLAND

Midland County

**HANDLON, Richard M.
HEINS, Sharon S.
MADDOX, Mark R.
MORRIS, Patricia T.
SCHNEIDER, Sidney B.
#SHELTON, Jr., Haskell H. WETMORE, Floyd E.**

MILFORD

Oakland County

**CALLUM, Alice W.
LORIDAS, Renee Vintzel**

MOUNT CLEMENS

Macomb County

**ANDERSON, Philip J.
FINAZZO, Lori J.
GLIME, Raymond G.**

KAPLAN, Steven M.
McCULLOUGH, Max D.
PIERCE, Hon. Lynne A.
RUSSELL, Karen
WYSS, William A.

MOUNT PLEASANT

Isabella County

THOMPSON, William R.

MUSKEGON

Muskegon County

BALGOOYEN, Fredric F.
COCHRANE, Darryl R.
SNIDER, II, I. John
VAN LEUVEN, Robert J.

NORTH MUSKEGON

Muskegon County

McNALLY, William F.

NOVI

Oakland County

KOHL, David D.

OKEMOS

Ingham County

BEHAN, Michael R.
BEHAN, Raymond R.
LOVIK, Mary M.
McLEOD, Ian C.

OXFORD

Oakland County

BUNTING, Robert L.

PARCHMENT

Kalamazoo County

HATCH, H. Van Den Berg

PAW PAW

Van Buren County

DUBAY, Mark D.

PETOSKEY

Emmet County

**SMITH, W. Richard
STROUP, Nathaniel W.**

PLYMOUTH

Wayne County

**ESPER, David J.
LEVITTE, Carol Alexander
THOMAS, John E.**

PONTIAC

Oakland County

STERLING, J. Robert

PORT HURON

St. Clair County

**BANKSON, S. Keith
HILL, Steven L.
KELLY, Charles G.
LANE, Cynthia A.
STAIGER, Jr., Frank O.
WHIPPLE, David C.**

PORTAGE

Kalamazoo County

**BARNARD, Jr. Robert J.
SMITH, Jr., C. Giles**

PRUDENVILLE

Roscommon County

MEIRING, Ronald C.

ROCHESTER

Oakland County

**COLBERT, James P.
COX, Arthur R.**

ROMEO

Macomb County

McLEAN, J. Gerald

ROYAL OAK

Oakland County

STARK, Sheldon J.

SAGINAW

Saginaw County

**CHAKLOS, Sr., Robert G.
COLLISON, Sr., Charles C.
MOSSNER, Eugene D.
SMITH, Jr., Lawrence Wm.**

ST. CLAIR SHORES

Macomb County

**GARVEY, Paul T.
GARVEY, Robert F.
MERRY, Cynthia E.
SHATZMAN, Pearl P.
SIEGAN, René S.**

ST. JOSEPH

Berrien County

**BUTZBAUGH, Alfred M.
CONYBEARE, Bruce C.
GLEISS, Henry W.
KELLER, S. Jack
SPELMAN, John H.
TAGLIA, Paul A.**

SAUGATUCK

Allegan County

OYLER, W. Tedd

SAULT STE. MARIE

Chippewa County

VEUM, Thomas J.

SHELBY

Macomb County

WOMACK, Jr., P. Douglas

SHELBY

Oceana County

PRINCE, Clifford W.

SOUTHFIELD

Oakland County

ACKER, Gerald H.

AMOS, Roberta M.

ANTONE, N. Peter

APPEL, Jeffrey S.

AUGER, Cheryl J.

BRUKOFF, William M.

COLLINS, Morton B.

CUTLER, Donald M.

GOODMAN, Barry J.

GROFFSKY, Richard L.

HAROUTUNIAN, Edward L.

JACOBS, John P.

JOHNSON, Charlene A.

#KEMPTON, Bruce C.

KINSLEY, Stephen L.

KRATCHMAN, D. Michael

KUHN, Loraine R.

LASSER, Marshall D.

LEVINE, Richard J.

LINDEN, Howard T.

%LOEB, Thomas M.

MARTENS, William L.

SCHWARTZ, Steven L.

SHULMAN, Marc I.

SILBER, Albert J.

SILVER, Howard

SILVER, Kenneth F.

&SULLIVAN, Brian R.

THURSWELL, Gerald E.

TRiest, Brent S.

TURNER, Lee I.

VOS, III, John F.

WARSH, Richard L.

WARTELL, C. Robert

WAX, Harvey I.

WEINER, Cyril V.

WOLOCK, Steven M.

STERLING HEIGHTS

Macomb County

BOLANOWSKI, Eugene R.
CARDAMONE, Emil E.
COLMAN, Neil M.
GOLDSTEIN, Ronald A.
GOODMAN, Mark D.
KATZ, Lawrence S.
LASCOE, John S.
LEGGHIO, Brian M.
O'REILLY, Paul J.
SCHOENHERR, Sr., Craig S.

SYLVAN LAKE

Oakland County

LOWENTHAL, Betty L.
RONAYNE, Colleen V.
RYAN, Thomas J.

TECUMSEH

Lenawee County

COOPER, David J.

THREE RIVERS

St. Joseph County

TUCKER, Theodore J.

TRAVERSE CITY

Grand Traverse County

BUDROS, Barbara D.
CHRISTOPHERSON, James A.
DENOYER, Lucy Knight
STARK, Harry S.
STOWE, David L.

TROY

Oakland County

ACKERMAN, Alan T.
BAIERS, James E.
BARKER, Lori A.
BASILE, Andrew R.
BOOKHOLDER, Ronald W.
EISENBERG, Marsha Katz

FELDSTEIN, Robert Z.
HEFFNER, Kathleen L.
HOHAUSER, Michael S.
HUDSON, Clarence L.
HUTSON, Michael W.
JACOBS, Mark S.
KEITH, Terrance A.
KELLY, Dale F.
KOCH, Walter O.
LANGE, Craig W.
LEWIS, Michael B.
LUCOW, Milton
MANTESE, Gerard V.
MILIA, Robert P.
MORROW, Raymond L.
NOVAK, Jr., Richard A.
SAWYER, Thomas G.
STEFANI, Michael L.
STERLING, Raymond J.
TALARICO, Paula M.
TARTT, Tyrone Chris
THOMAS, Jamie Ann
THOMAS, Joseph W.

WARREN

Macomb County

GUERRIERO, Timothy M.
HEWSON, James F.
KISTNER, Leo M.
ROEHL, Charles A.

WATERFORD

Oakland County

KUTHY, Douglas E.

WEST BLOOMFIELD

Oakland County

LOWER, Lynn L.
OLTARZ-SCHWARTZ, Sara
SALTZMAN, Shirley A.

YPSILANTI

Washtenaw County

DODD, Gregory L.
EGGAN, Andrew M.

MURPHY, John J.
VINCENT, Michael J.

ZEELAND

Ottawa County

HOESCH, Kenneth W.

Appendix "D"

Statement of Attorney Discipline Board Expenditures (Budget and Actual)

Fiscal Year Ended September 30, 1999.

Expense Item	Actual	Budget	Favorable <u>(Unfavorable)</u>
Salaries	\$313,121	\$312,800	(\$321)
Payroll Taxes	21,782	23,929	2,147
Employee Insurance	42,695	46,800	4,105
Pension Contribution	24,356	33,157	8,801
Rent	82,337	89,740	7,403
Electricity	2,212	3,000	788
Parking	10,728	10,080	(648)
Law Clerks and Professional Fees	-	5,000	5,000
Bookkeeping and Audit	4,000	4,000	-
Transcripts	87,057	113,000	25,943
Machine Rental	6,871	6,650	(221)
Meetings	3,818	6,650	2,832
Travel	20,126	18,000	(2,126)
Telephone	4,800	5,000	200
Books and Subscriptions	2,168	3,500	1,332
Office Supplies	7,944	8,000	56
Printing and Stationery	2,657	5,000	2,343
Postage	14,151	20,000	5,849
Insurance	3,048	4,300	1,252
Repairs and Maintenance	11,544	10,000	(1,544)
Dues	853	1,000	147
Capital Expenditures	30,408	32,000	1,592
Miscellaneous	<u>2,174</u>	<u>2,500</u>	<u>326</u>
TOTAL	\$698,850	\$764,106	\$65,256

1. Designated "GA" in Appendix "A." 2. Designated "FA" in Appendix "A." 3. Grievance Administrator v Attorney Discipline Board, 447 Mich 411 (1994). 4. ⁴ *Deceased.

#Retired or resigned as panelist.

%Inactive panelist.

&All full-time judges removed as hearing panelists.